

Morocco - Functional Literacy

Report generated on: August 11, 2017

Visit our data catalog at: <https://data.mcc.gov/evaluations/index.php>

Overview

Identification

COUNTRY

Morocco

EVALUATION TITLE

Functional Literacy

EVALUATION TYPE

Independent Performance Evaluation

ID NUMBER

DDI-MCC-ISG-MAR-PE-FLVT-2017-V01.

Version

VERSION DESCRIPTION

- v01: Edited, anonymous dataset for public distribution.

Overview

ABSTRACT

This performance evaluation uses a pre-post methodology to evaluate the functional literacy subactivity of the Artisan and Fez Medina Project. The evaluation followed the Kirkpatrick model trying to assemble a set of qualitative and quantitative evidence. To do so the evaluation team questioned 6 main criteria : relevance, coherence, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability and also assessed the program gender and environment approaches. 17 focus groups, 500 respondents to a survey and 70 semi-structured interviews contributed to collect primary and secondary sources of information so to triangulate findings.

EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

Pre-Post

UNITS OF ANALYSIS

Individuals

KIND OF DATA

Sample survey data [ssd]

TOPICS

Topic	Vocabulary	URI
Vocational Education	World Bank	
Participation / Empowerment	World Bank	

KEYWORDS

Vocational Training, Functional Literacy, Ex-post evaluation

Coverage

GEOGRAPHIC COVERAGE

Marrakech, Souss Massa Draa, Tanger-Tétouan, and Fez Boulemane

UNIVERSE

The evaluation team identified three sources of primary data: government, non-governmental institutions, and individuals.

The greatest geographical concentration of participant centers among three of the 12 regions were:

- Région de Rabat-Salé-Kénitra,
- Région de Fès-Meknès
- Région de Tangier-Tétouan-Al Hoceïma

The evaluation team drew the evaluation sample across these three regions to achieve the sample target. Representatives from the national government and the regions of Fez and Tangier were selected from among those who represented departments and agencies that participated directly in project activities and thus considered key informants. Specific departments and agencies selected for interview were discussed with MCC staff May/June 2016 and include:

- Directorate for the Fight Against Illiteracy (Direction de la Lutte Contre l'Alphabétisme - DLCA). (Not available in Meknes and Tangier)
- Ministry of Artisan Affairs, Social Economics & Solidarity (Ministère de l'Artisanat - MA)
- Ministry of Agriculture & Maritime Fisheries (Ministère de l'Agriculture et des Pêches maritimes - MAPM). Not available in (Meknes and Tangier)

Producers and Sponsors

PRIMARY INVESTIGATOR(S)

Name	Affiliation
International Solution Group (ISG)	

FUNDING

Name	Abbreviation	Role
Millennium Challenge Corporation	MCC	

Metadata Production

METADATA PRODUCED BY

Name	Abbreviation	Affiliation	Role
Millennium Challenge Corporation	MCC		Review of Metadata

DATE OF METADATA PRODUCTION

2017-01-31

DDI DOCUMENT VERSION

Version 1 (January 31 2017)

DDI DOCUMENT ID

DDI-MCC-ISG-MAR-PE-FLVT-2017-V01.

MCC Compact and Program

COMPACT OR THRESHOLD

Morocco Compact

PROGRAM

On August 31, 2007, the Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC) signed the Millennium Challenge Compact (MCC-Morocco) with the Government of the Kingdom of Morocco (GoM), valued at \$697.5 million. MCC identified three key sectors: agriculture, fishing, and artisanal handicrafts, in six crucial regions of the country. As part of the Compact, the GoM identified five projects for MCC support, focusing on agriculture/fisheries, artisans/handicrafts, financial services and enterprises. The goal was to reduce poverty via economic growth by increasing productivity and improving employment in sectors with

strong growth potential. MCC expected the projects to increase Morocco's gross domestic product (GDP) by approximately USD\$118 million annually, benefitting approximately 600,000 people directly and 3 million indirectly over the five-year compact. One of the five supported projects, the Artisan and Fez Medina Project (Projet Artisanat Fès Médina - AFM) aimed to stimulate economic growth by increasing value to the tourism and artisan sectors, increasing value of the cultural, historic resources of the Fez Medina via literacy and vocational training, artisan production of products, and Fez Medina Artisans improvement. In February 2009, Morocco's inter-ministerial commission for the Compact proposed to expand the functional literacy component to include the agriculture and small-scale fishing sectors in order to better contribute to the goals of the Compact; and to re-focus vocational training for the artisan sector on five fields with strong cultural content and high potential for export growth, in accordance with "Vision 2015" a strategic development program initiated in 2007 to develop the handicraft sector. The AFM subsequently became the Functional Literacy and Vocational Training (FLVT) Activity (2010-2013: \$32.8 million), the restated aim of which was to reinforce the basic skills of individuals who were active or seeking employment in the Artisan, Fisheries, and Agribusiness sectors - including beneficiary artisans from other Compact sectors. The FLVT's ultimate objectives were to: (1) improve the revenues of artisans, (2) improve the revenues of people engaged in fishing, and (3) improve the revenues of farmers. The activity was divided into three sub-activities: 1. Functional Literacy (FL) for 69,000 beneficiaries (artisans, fishers, and farmers) 2. Vocational Training (VT) for 23,700 beneficiaries (traditional artisans) 3. Program to Expand Access to Qualifications and Competencies (PEAQC) for grants to 30 private and civil society entities to support FL and VT (APP 2013). The project was implemented as a multi-tiered set of sub-activities including interventions involving (1) national and regional governments; (2) organizational level of FL and VT training and NGOs from the FL and PEAQC sub-activities; and (3) individuals including trainees, trainers, the self-employed and employers.

Functional Literacy: MCC commissioned UNESCO and DCLA to deliver training (based on UNESCO's two-stage, 500 hour FL program) to selected NGOs in testing and certifying graduates, and build the capacity of DCLA to sustain the approach after project completion. Of the three tranches of training, the first was delivered by government trainers, with the following tranches delivered by private, non-governmental organizations. **Outputs:** The project exceeded its target of 69,000 trainees across the sectors of artisans, fishing and agriculture by 731 participants. 67% were female, substantially exceeding the target of 42%. While targets for course graduation were 45.6% for males and 76.3% for females, actual rates were 32.0% for males and 55.5% for females, thus below targets. The project met or exceeded targets related to number of trainers trained; managers and supervisors trained; equipment provided, and training materials adapted. **Outcomes:** More than half of the trainees surveyed by ISG reported increased income after training. Most increases were at the low end ranging under 1,000 to 2,500 Moroccan Dirhams (MAD). 76% of employers of FL graduates expressed satisfaction with the graduates they hired and support to the program. The major outcome resulted from the relationship between UNESCO and DCLA. DCLA is now in a position to deliver FL programs sector by sector thus preparing illiterate populations to enroll into VT programs. Its capacity however is limited so that additional resources are needed to expand services to all ministries and to serve a wider audience. Also, FL training shifted to the private sector where NGOs were trained and implemented FL programs. This has set into place the future FL training delivery system. **Stakeholder Feedback:** For future programming, employers suggested that training include modules on communication, computers, marketing, and employability 'soft' skills such as punctuality. Trainers were positive regarding the content of the training program as well as the opportunity it afforded them to share experiences. Many felt, however, that the program could be shorter. Managers receiving training reported support for a number of interventions such as those related to management, program, linkages and data management. Fewer negative comments were proffered suggesting that managers were satisfied with the program. Most trainees across the three sectors expressed satisfaction with the course-related elements of the training program, with little changes requested.

Vocational Training: The VT sub-activity (activity two) targeted five trades within the artisan sector and under the MA - leatherwork, metalwork, weaving/weaving/embroidery/weaving/embroidery, carpentry, and pottery/ ceramics. The VT component sought to establish a standardized training system following a Competency-Based Approach (CBA) in which participants learn technical skills, called competencies, as a priority, with theory as a secondary element. **Outputs:** Projected enrollment of females exceeded target enrollment (934 versus 1069) while males fell below the target (7766 versus 7581). The targeted certification rates were below an acceptable number. The low actual certification rates across the five trades remain concerning. Only 37% of those entering the residential training program completed the program and passed the certification examination. Furthermore, only 29% of apprentices were certified. The enrollment pattern of males and females appears to be traditionally oriented with most females enrolled in the traditional trades of embroidery/weaving and pottery/ceramics. Very few were enrolled in non-traditional trades for females such as carpentry, metalwork or leatherwork. Other outputs included: equipment provided to 16 EFPs; an additional 23 EFAs were supported; 197 trainers and 98 administrative managers trained; a new continuous training program was designed and delivered to 15,038 self-employed artisans; and, an MIS system was introduced. **Outcomes:** Cost, both in terms of unit costs for trainees and funding in general, are the major constraints to efficiency and sustainability. The extremely high dropout rate among trainees (target of 33% versus actual of 41%) increases unit cost per graduate and brings into question the steps centers may take to reduce the dropout rate. Most training centers are focused on training with less involvement in job placement, career guidance and counseling and other services that would motivate trainees to complete programs. Government funding is the only source of capital that training centers have and as the budget is reduced the number of trainees is reduced. **Stakeholder Feedback:** For the VT sub-activity the evaluation noted satisfaction among employers with both the graduates and their training centers. In general, beneficiaries considered the training programs to be of relatively high quality and relevant to the needs of trainees and employers. Although there was some criticism about the mismatch between skills acquired from training and those required by the job, employers were willing to provide on the job training (OJT) to close the gap. Some employers complimented the

system and others acknowledged the importance of the training centers in providing a trained labor force, although others suggested that trainees needed more training. Trainees also gave high marks for the training they received. More than half attributed their higher income post-training to their participation in the project (all between less than 1000 mad to 2000 mad). Almost two thirds reported they thought little or no change was needed across all elements of the training program from content through to trainers. Trainers and training managers were supportive of the training received with some criticism of training materials and the length of the program. Self-employed artisans reported the CT program was too short to be effective in helping them. Many indicated they wished to enroll in more workshops if offered. PEAQC: The PEAQC component sought to strengthen professional skills for artisans and apprentices, offer literacy and vocational training to disadvantaged populations, promote employability, professional placement and entrepreneurship among the beneficiaries of the FL and VT activities. It achieved this through direct grant support to twenty-seven Moroccan NGOs. Outputs: Thirty contracts (between \$50,000 and \$200,000) were planned to be awarded. Twenty-seven awards were made, and twenty-three contracts completed. In total, 10,720 beneficiaries of handicrafts, agriculture and fisheries in literacy and vocational training were supported (141% of target), with 9,010 beneficiaries receiving certificates of completion (119% of target). However, 4,230 women received certificates of completion (39%), below the target of 4,777. Institutionally, 45 cooperatives were established with 825 members (68% women) as were two networks of cooperatives and associations. Outcomes: The PEAQC activity reinforced government intentions to contract with the private sector for services. Every project provided skills training or FL training. Underserved populations such as women, youth, and those in isolated communities benefitted greatly. New cooperatives and associations were created bringing people together to harness human potential. NGO capacity to deliver FL training was developed. ISG noted a need by the appropriate the GoM agency to synthesize the diverse outcomes of the activity and to select those products and processes that achieved a high level of success as compared to benchmarks that were identified in the literature review. Such tools and processes can be adapted and adopted by future donors to enhance their project delivery. In this regard, the project missed an opportunity to identify, consolidate and recommend those shown as effective. In defense of the project design, most programs ended later or towards the conclusion of the overall program, preventing such a synthesis from taking place. Stakeholder Feedback: NGOs reported having achieved their intended outcomes including providing the required 20% matching funds. ADAM acquired additional matching funds to double the number trained from 600 to 1200, more than half being females. ADAM reported that 150 participation created new enterprises and 14 new cooperatives. EWF reported an increase product innovation and quality as well as improved beneficiary self confidence and motivation. Most disappointing to the interviewees was their inability to access markets through effective marketing practices. Cooperatives could not continue paying business costs such as rental fees or salaries. They had insufficient capital and there was no subsidy that allowed sufficient time to create a viable and sustainable market. Soon after the project, the cooperative closed. In general, there seemed to have been an inability to progress from the transitional period during the project to a fully viable business at the end of the project. Cross-cutting Issues: Across three of the five VT activities (carpentry, metalwork and leatherwork), participation rates for females were very low. Only 12% participated in either the residential or apprenticeship programs and their participation was limited to the weaving/embroidery or pottery/ceramics trades. By contrast, participation by females in the FL program far exceeded male participation. More than 25% of females participated in the CT program. Dropout rates for females in the residential and apprenticeship programs were 11% higher than among males (46% versus 35%). Unlike FL, the selection of trainees for VT was much higher for males than females and females were placed in the traditionally female trades of weaving/weaving/embroidery and pottery/ceramics. The Competency-Based Approach (CBA) was used effectively in the residential and apprenticeship programs as was the equipment supplied to the residential program. CBA was less successful in the training of master artisans due to the limited training time available. The apprenticeship and residential VT programs was in line with best practices for CBA training and will integrate easily into current efforts to create a national system. Although the project helped foster improved communication between literacy and vocational training, further work is needed to establish a properly linked system that eliminates the requirement for secondary-level education. Those individuals partially literate but below acceptance level into entry level trade training cannot earn an FL certificate, nor are they able to produce proof of secondary education. From Outputs and Outcomes to Impacts: Impact on economic development may be augmented with GoM's commitment to creating a complete enabling environment. There is evidence that GoM has been and will continue to move in the appropriate direction leading to an autonomous NTA. In a limited number of cases at VT training centers, some training was provided in entrepreneurship leading to the creation of microenterprises that can thrive in local, domestic markets. FLVT may have provided some additional skills but did not offer opportunities for graduates to proceed through the transitional period of business creation when critical support is needed. Given the importance of employers in supply-side and demand-side analyses their participation in the project's feedback mechanisms would have greatly benefitted the project's processes. Finally, the lack of GoM post-project investment in line with the project creates a barrier to the achievement of outcomes and impacts.

MCC SECTOR

Capacity Building and Institutional Development (Cap Bldg & Inst Dev)

PROGRAM LOGIC

ISG established a detailed logical framework for review under this evaluation. Figure 4 identifies the ex-post project evaluation indicators by target respondent, method for measurement, types of disaggregation applied, and data collection instrument used. Indicators Measurement Disaggregation Data Collection Instrument Government Sustainability: (1) environmental support; (2) funding stability; (3) partnerships; (4) organizational capacity; (5) program evaluation; (6)

program adaptation; (7) communications; and, (8) strategic planning. Five questions using a 7 point scale for each of eight indicators and averaged to gain an index measure for each indicator and an overall measure of sustainability. Total self-report survey of 40 questions · Level of government (regional and national) · Departments such as DLCA and ministries of fisheries, agriculture and artisans (up to eight departments/agencies) Program Sustainability Assessment Tool

Organizational change: (1) governance; (2) management; (3) roles and responsibilities; (4) revenues; (5) linkages; (6) M&E and MIS; (7) general Pre-project and post project change identified through focus group interviews · Level of government (regional and national) · Departments such as DLCA and ministries of fisheries, agriculture and artisans (up to eight departments/agencies) Focus Group Interview Instrument for Managers and supervisors of national and regional government officials

Organizational change attributed to the project Forced choice question identifying percent attributed to the project · Level of government (regional and national) · Departments such as DLCA and ministries of fisheries, agriculture and artisans (up to eight departments/agencies) Focus Group Interview Instrument for Managers and supervisors of national and regional government offices

Management Information System Databases Number and description of databases related to project · Government, donor, other sources Secondary sources and questions to MIS staff among stakeholders

Trainees Numbers Trained Numerical count · FL, EFP, CFA, CT, PEAQC · Training managers, trainers, trainees · Gender · Youth and adult Secondary sources Number of artisans trained as trainers Numerical count · Carpentry, leatherwork; metalwork; pottery/ceramics; weaving/weaving/embroidery · Gender · Residential, apprenticeship, continuing training Secondary sources Trainees: (1) enrolled; (2) dropped out; (3) certified/graduated; (4) percent certified/ graduated Numerical count · FL, EFP, CFA, CT, PEAQC · Gender · Youth and adult Secondary sources Income before and after training Forced-choice seven point intervals from “below,” “between” and “above. Stated in local currency amounts” · FL, CFA, EFP, and PEAQC (including continuing training · Those completing one and those completing more than one training program (both FL/VT or PEAQC) · Fisheries, agriculture and 5 trades within artisan theme · Gender · Youth and adult Self-report assessment tool for trainees and secondary sources Job search success- (1) how placed; (2) length of search; (3) number of employers contacted; (4) employed in area trained; (5) problems experienced Complete 5 forced-choice and one open-ended questions- one question per indicator As directly above Self-report assessment tool for trainees Employment (1) employer type Complete 1 forced-choice As directly above Self-report assessment tool for trainees Training relevancy Complete one yes/no question As directly above Self-report assessment tool for trainees Training satisfaction Complete one yes/no question As directly above Self-report assessment tool for trainees Evaluation of trainers & training program: (1) knowledge (2) practical skills; (3) course content; (4) industrial attachment; (5) instructional manuals; (6) textbooks; (7) equipment; (8) lab work; (9) pedagogy; (10) instructor knowledge; (11) instructor practical skills; (12) length of training Five point Interval scale from 100% to 0% where 0% means no changes required and 100% means complete change is required · Those taking FL or VT training; or both VT training and PEAQC; or FL training and PEAQC training; or all three · Fisheries, agriculture and artisan trade · Gender · Youth and adult Self-report assessment tool for trainees Improvement in productivity of self employed: (1) safety; (2) productivity; (3) skills; (4) marketing Five point Interval scale from 100% to 0% where 0% means no changes required and 100% means complete change is required · Those completing 1 CT program; those who have completed two programs; and if applicable those completing 3 programs Self-report assessment tool for trainees Trainers Number of instructors with private sector experience As a percentage of total number of instructors · Trained in delivery of 2 year, 18 month, FL, and/or 4-days program · Master Artisans receiving trainer training- · Gender · Full time versus part time · Program of trainer: FL, CFA, EFP, PEAQC · Possibly those using CBA versus those not · Possibly those using provided equipment versus those not Self-report assessment tool for trainers Length of experience as an instructor Interval measure beginning with less than one, and continuing through more than 10 As above As above Training received: (1) liked about training; (2) disliked about training; (3) recommended improvements Three open-ended questions where respondent lists responses As above As above Evaluation of CBA training program: (1) knowledge (2) practical skills; (3) course content; (4) industrial attachment; (5) instructional manuals; (6) textbooks; (7) equipment; (8) lab work; (9) pedagogy; (10) instructor knowledge; (11) instructor practical skills; (12) length of training Five point Interval scale from 100% to 0% where 0% means no changes required and 100% means complete change is required As above As above Types of professional development activities accessed: (1) other training; (2) received mentoring; (3) industrial attachment; (4) completing certification or degree; (5) use computer on-line in field of work; (6) attended conferences or professional meetings; (7) being evaluated by supervisor; (8) other Respondents choose one or more: made available by government; taken before project; taken after project As above As above Training Institutions Sustainability: (1) environmental support; (2) funding stability; (3) partnerships; (4) organizational capacity; (5) program evaluation; (6) program adaptation; (7) communications; and, (8) strategic planning. Five questions using a 7 point scale for each of eight indicators and averaged to gain an index measure for each indicator and overall sustainability. Total self-report survey of 40 questions · CFA, FL, EFP training centers and PEAQC centers · Continuing education Program Sustainability Assessment Tool

Organizational change: (1) governance; (2) management; (3) services provided; (4) Core program; (5) linkages; (6) procurement, maintenance, transport; (7) revenues; (8) M&E and research; (9) general Pre-project and post project change identified through focus group interviews · CFA, FL, and EFP · Centers delivering continuing education programs · Project and comparison group training centres Focus Group Interview Instrument for Managers and Supervisors of Training Centers (government and private) Organizational change attributed to the project Forced choice question identifying percent attributed to the project · CFA, FL, and EFP · Centers delivering continuing education programs Focus Group Interview Instrument for Managers and supervisors of Training Centers (government and private) Competency-based Approach (CBA): (1) Competencies & Learning Activities; (2) Assessment & Evaluation; (3) Learning Resources; (4) Course technology and navigation support personalized learning pathways; (5) Course facilitates access to support services essential to student success; (6) commitment to accessibility and usability for all students; (7)

alignment of course with policies; Qualitative analysis of all stakeholder representatives including 3 point measurement of 7 indicators -(1) improvement needed; (2) effective; and exemplary. Completed by evaluator through questioning and observation · Institution Type: PEAQC, CFA, EFP offering CBA Case Study method Equipment (1) supplied by the project: (2) amount supplied and (3) perceived contribution to success Qualitative analysis through questioning and observation · CFA, EFP managers and trainers · Complete equipment package early in project; partially equipped centres; no new equipment for centres · Project and comparison group Secondary Source Data Focus group interview Instrument Observation as part of CBA case study method PEAQC Increased attractiveness of Training Qualitative analysis through questioning of stakeholders and beneficiaries · PEAQC by managers, trainers and trainees Case study PEAQC grants received Shown by grant objectives and rated as not completed, improvement needed, effective, and exemplary No disaggregation Rating by former project staff and secondary sources PEAQC number of cooperatives created Numerical count shown by name and location of institution No disaggregation Secondary sources Graduates employed Numerical count · CFA and EFP · Gender · Youth, adult · Project versus comparison group Secondary sources Employers Number of trainees hired Number of trainees hired and trainees hired as a percent to total number of employees · Trades - agriculture fisheries, artisans · Artisans - carpentry, metalwork, leatherwork, pottery/ceramics, weaving/weaving/embroidery Employer Self-Report Survey Employment Level Identified from List · Skilled, semi-skilled, labor, other Employer Self-Report Survey Employer satisfaction with competency and trainability 7-point scale from unsatisfied to satisfied and forced choice responses to specific questions · Trades - agriculture fisheries, artisans · Artisans - carpentry, metalwork, leatherwork, pottery/ceramics, weaving/weaving/embroidery Employer Self-Report Survey Quality of training Forced choice question and open-ended list of recommendations · Trades - agriculture fisheries, artisans · Artisans - carpentry, metalwork, leatherwork, pottery/ceramics, weaving/weaving/embroidery Employer Self-Report Survey

PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS

A comprehensive assessment examines effects on all participants. Each participant group, and where applicable the organizations they represent, were evaluated to analyze the crosscutting effects among the three sub-activities along with the interrelated elements within each sub-activity. At the government level, in coordination with MCC, ISG selected officials from agencies at the national and regional levels that participated in the project. Government encompasses the entire system of training within participating ministries and agencies. This included ministries such as the Ministry of Artisan Affairs, Social Economics & Solidarity (Ministère de l'Artisanat - MA), the Ministry of Agriculture & Maritime Fisheries (Ministère de l'Agriculture et des Pêches maritimes - MAMF) and the Ministry of National Education and Training (MNET) and their relevant departments and quasi-independent agencies such as the Directorate for the Fight Against Illiteracy (Direction de la Lutte Contre l'alphabetisme- DLCA) and the Secretary of State for Artisan Affairs (SECA). To assess organizational effectiveness and quality, managers/supervisors, trainees, trainers and employers were selected to participate in the evaluation. Sources were disaggregated to identify results of a particular sub-group such as youth, females and part time instructors. These different perspectives shed light on outcomes as well as strengths and weaknesses of the project.

Sampling

Study Population

The evaluation team identified three sources of primary data: government, non-governmental institutions, and individuals. The greatest geographical concentration of participant centers among three of the 12 regions were: · Région de Rabat-Salé-Kénitra, · Région de Fès-Meknès · Région de Tangier-Tétouan-Al Hoceïma. The evaluation team drew the evaluation sample across these three regions to achieve the sample target. Representatives from the national government and the regions of Fez and Tangier were selected from among those who represented departments and agencies that participated directly in project activities and thus considered key informants. Specific departments and agencies selected for interview were discussed with MCC staff May/June 2016 and include: · Directorate for the Fight Against Illiteracy (Direction de la Lutte Contre l'Alphabétisme - DLCA). (Not available in Meknes and Tangier) · Ministry of Artisan Affairs, Social Economics & Solidarity (Ministère de l'Artisanat - MA) · Ministry of Agriculture & Maritime Fisheries (Ministère de l'Agriculture et des Pêches maritimes - MAPM). Not available in (Meknes and Tangier)

Sampling Procedure

The sample universe consisted of the 39 VT training institutions (16 Vocational Training Centers/EFPs; 23 Apprentice Training Centers/CFA) that participated in the project and the 35 NGOs/government training sites providers that provided the FL training for artisans and through ministries for agriculture and fisheries. The sample selected from these was as follows:

Table 1 Sample outline

Sample Target Sample Achieved

7 EFP vocational training centers (offering 18-month apprenticeships) 6 EFP centers
 9 CFA vocational training centers (offering two-year residential programs) 10 CFA centers
 6 FL government training providers 7 government training providers
 3 FL NGO training providers 3 NGO training providers
 2 PEAQC institutions (for case studies)

Most centers selected were within the catchment areas of the three specified regions. To achieve the required sample size for EFPs, two centers: the Marrakesh IAT and the Bene Millal CQPAT, were selected from outside the boundaries of the three regions.

The FL sampling target of nine training providers was achieved by the evaluation team and a tenth FGI was conducted at a maritime training institute in Tangier. The VT center sampling target was achieved but with some variation. Sites in Meknes and Sefrou were shown as two distinct training centers when in fact one center at each location provided both CFA and EFP programs. A second site in Meknes offered the CFA program instead of an EFP program as planned. In actuality, 14 sites were surveyed where two represented two different programs equating to sixteen separate surveys. Six (of seven planned) surveys were conducted at EFP centers, and ten (of nine planned) surveys were completed at CFA centers. In total, 25 of 26 planned FL, and VT FGIs were conducted by the ISG team.

In terms of the FL and VT sub-activities, the 16 VT training centers served as catchment areas for all individual participants. For each center, the minimum sample numbers selected is detailed in the table below.

Table 2 Sample Size

Category Numbers Total

Vocational Training Centers

Trainees Per Center 15 X 16 240

Employers Per Center 5 X 16 80

Trainers Per Center 5 X 16 80

Master Artisans Trained 5 X 16 80

Self-Employed 4 Days Training 4 X 16 64

Total VT Individuals 544

Functional Literacy Locations

Trainees Per Location 15 X 9 135

Employers Per Location 5 X 9 45

Trainers Per Location 5 X 9 45

Total FL Individuals 225

In addition, two PEAQC institutions from among the 23 participating in the project were selected. The two case studies required a broad selection of stakeholders and beneficiaries to provide input to the evaluators. The two case study PEAQCs

were selected by: (1) identifying selection criteria; (2) completing a summary figure showing the results of the selection criteria; (3) ranking results into high, medium and low priority; (4) and selecting the two PEAQC sites from among those ranked "1" or high priority. (6) MCC was the final arbiter in selection of the two PEAQCs. Further detail on the specifics of the selection process is provided in the PEAQC case study attached to this report.

In summary the Table below compares both the projected sample size and the actual sample size achieved against the project's total beneficiary reach.

Deviations from Sample Design

NA

Response Rate

Actual Sample Size against Project Target

Target Audience Sample Size Project Total % of Project Actual Sample % of Actual Sample / Project

Government: Central Government (in Rabat only) Regional Government TOTAL 1 2 3 1 12 13 100% 16.7% 23.1% 1 12 13 100% 16.7% 23.1%

Training Organizations: FL locations CFA Centers EFP Centers TOTAL 9 9 7 25 35 23 16 74 25.7% 39.1% 43.8% 33.8% 10 10 6 26 28.6% 43.5% 37.5% 35.1%

Case Studies: PEAQCs CBA (multiple sources unspecified) 2 - 23* -** 8.7% - 2 - 8.7% -

Individuals: FL Trainees per location (15 X 9) VT Trainees per locations (15 X 16) FL Employers per location (5 X 9) VT Employers near center (5 X 16) FL Trainers per location (5 X 9) VT Trainers per center (5X16) Master Artisans Trained per Center (5 X 16) Self-employed Trained per Center (4 X 16) 165 240 45 80 45 80 80 64 69731 8655 unknown unknown 1856 196 Unknown 15,038 0.7% 2.8% - - 2.4% 40.8% - 0.4% - 123 201 19 76 31 43 18 66 0.2% 2.3% unknown unknown 1.6% 21.9% unknown 0.4%

* 23 represents total PEAQC grants that were completed

**CBA case study will include an unspecified number of training organizations, donors, government and others

***240 trainers trained may or may not include master artisans trained as trainers

Questionnaires

No content available

Data Collection

Data Collection Dates

Start	End	Cycle
2016-08-01	2016-10-31	N/A

Data Collectors

Name	Abbreviation	Affiliation
International Solutions Group	ISG	

Supervision

Post training, the local evaluation team implemented data collection from October 21 through to November 9, 2016. A group of 4 local evaluators secured assistance from training center staff and others to identify respondent locations and contact details allowing the team to administer self-report surveys to groups of individuals. During this time, ISG's field researcher/administrator identified data sources including databases such as the Information Management System for Literacy Programs (SIMPA), various MSI and other reports, and other types of documents. This information was used to verify data tables found in the MSI final report. ISG also implemented focus group interviews (FGI) with government officials at the national and the regional levels. However, regional activity was discontinued after the project with the MAMF and DLCA and no representatives were available for regional-level FGIs. In addition, the evaluation team interviewed key informants in preparation for the CBA and PEAQC case studies, attached to this report.

Data Processing

Data Editing

Data was checked for clarity and consistency of entry and cleaned manually. Most of the entries were made via selection of specific pre made choices and these were reviewed for consistency.

Data was checked for missing and erroneous data.

Where there were queries especially on the qualitative data, these were clarified in January 2017 in consultation with data collectors. Also a consensus on the presentation of the quantitative data was prepared.

ISG utilized Microsoft Excel.

Other Processing

To accompany the MCC Morocco Surveys, ISG has developed data entry files for the local evaluators to use to enter their data after the Surveys/FGDs have been administered (please see the Ex-Post evaluation Training Manual for more information on the administration of the surveys). This can be done from their home location using laptop/PC post data collection or at the time the Local Evaluator chooses, but completed no later than five working days after data collection is considered complete. The data entry spreadsheets are developed in Microsoft Excel® XP for the PC by ISG strictly using the evaluation tools and its individual questions. There are seven data entry files, each associated to the relevant survey tool in the manual. It was imperative that the data is entered in a standardized, correct manner. The assignment's data entry files are made up of several sheets within an Excel® workfile. Each sheet in the file is labeled by the name of the associated tool that was used during the data collection phase. These labeled sheet names are located at the bottom of the screen.

Evaluators were instructed to simply click on the labeled tabs to move between sheets. Evaluators would enter survey data manually in the appropriate sheet for each tool used. Data entry was implemented by 4 local evaluators, each assigned a set number of total entries. Data entry began in October and ended at the end of November 2016 - once data was checked and reviewed for any issues by ISG.

Data Appraisal

No content available